



# BRIDGING THE GAP BETWEEN RESEARCH AND ADVOCACY At-A-Glance: Research on Preemption, Health, and Equity

#### **Last Updated April 2023**

### Introduction

Local governments are on the front lines for adopting policies aimed at improving health outcomes and reducing health, racial, and gender inequities. But the misuse of state preemption threatens the ability of cities, counties and towns to adopt health- and equity-promoting laws and policies. This resource from the <u>Local Solutions</u> <u>Support Center (LSSC)</u> and <u>ChangeLab Solutions</u> provides advocates with the research and data they need to document the harmful consequences of preemption and advocate for repealing inequitable preemption laws.

#### **Issue Areas**

COVID-19 Response and Recovery	1
Public Health and Cross-Cutting Research	2
Worker Protections and Economic Regulation	5
Minimum Wage	5
Paid Leave	6
Equitable Housing Policies	6
Preemption in the South	7
Preempting in the Midwest	8
Local Fiscal Authority	9

## **COVID-19 Response and Recovery**

Widespread <u>misuse of state preemption</u> has chilled local policymaking, forced localities to start from behind when responding to the pandemic, and prevented effective, timely responses to rapidly evolving public health and economic threats.<sup>1</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Haddow, K, Carr, D, Winig, BD, Adler, S. *Preemption, Public Health, and Equity in the Time of COVID-19*. August 2020. <a href="https://www.publichealthlawwatch.org/covid19-policy-playbook">https://www.publichealthlawwatch.org/covid19-policy-playbook</a>.

- A <u>research brief</u> found that in states with more preemption laws, both local and state governments were substantially less likely to adopt innovative policy responses to COVID-19.<sup>2</sup>
  - A <u>series of case studies</u> examining how state preemption of local housing policies has affected crisis response and recovery efforts during COVID-19 found that:
    - o Local governments failed to consider adopting local policies that would conflict with existing state preemption laws even if such policies could help stabilize housing for at-risk renters.<sup>3</sup>
    - o Local policies that were not directly preempted were nonetheless "chilled" and not pursued due to concerns that acting would spark legal challenges or new preemption efforts at the state level.<sup>4</sup>
- Research shows that preemption of indoor dining closure laws dining may have increased the spread of COVID-19 as cities with indoor dining closure laws saw COVID-19 case rates decrease by 55% over 6 weeks when compared to cities that were preempted from passing such laws.<sup>5</sup>

## **Public Health and Cross-Cutting Research**

State preemption has <u>kept local governments</u> from enacting laws to improve public health, such as regulating the sale of commercial tobacco and alcohol, promoting healthy eating, and enacting gun safety regulations, <sup>6,7</sup> as well as local laws that address <u>social determinants of health</u> such as economic security, access to safe, stable, and affordable housing, anti-discrimination protections, and access to quality education.<sup>8</sup>

https://www.urban.org/research/publication/state-preemption-local-housing-protections.

https://www.urban.org/research/publication/state-preemption-local-housing-protections.

https://journals.lww.com/epidem/Fulltext/2022/03000/The Impact of Keeping Indoor Dining Closed on.7.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Treskon M, Docter B. *Preemption and Its Impact on Policy Responses to COVID-19*. Urban Institute. September 2020. https://www.urban.org/research/publication/preemption-and-its-impact-policy-responses-covid-19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Greene S, Ramakrishnan K, Morales-Burnett J. *State Preemption of Local Housing Protections: Lessons from a Pandemic*. Urban Institute. September 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Greene S, Ramakrishnan K, Morales-Burnett J. *State Preemption of Local Housing Protections: Lessons from a Pandemic*. Urban Institute. September 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Mahl-Schnake, A, O'Leary, G, Mullachery, P, Vaidya, V, Connor, G, Rollins, H, Kolker, K, Diez, R, Ana, V, Bilal, U. The Impact of Keeping Indoor Dining Closed on COVID-19 Rates Among Large US Cities. *Epidemiology*. March 2022;33(2):200-208. doi: 10.1097/EDE.000000000001444.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> ChangeLab Solutions. *Consequences of Preemption for Public Health and Equity*. July 2020. https://www.changelabsolutions.org/product/understanding-preemption.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> ChangeLab Solutions. *Assessing & Addressing Preemption: A Toolkit for Local Policy Campaigns*. September 2020. https://www.changelabsolutions.org/product/assessing-addressing-preemption.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Carr D, Adler S, Winig BD, Montez JK. Equity First: Conceptualizing a Normative Framework to Assess the Role of Preemption in Public Health. *Milbank Quarterly*. 2020;98:131-149. doi:10.1111/1468-0009.12444. <a href="https://www.changelabsolutions.org/product/equity-first-approach-assessing-preemption">https://www.changelabsolutions.org/product/equity-first-approach-assessing-preemption</a>.

- Research shows that the misuse of state preemption often blocks policies that promote health and equity, with severe – and preventable – consequences such as <u>lower life expectancy</u>, <u>increased infant mortality</u>, and worse <u>overall health outcomes</u>.<sup>9,10</sup>
- Research suggests that growing disparities in life expectancy are attributable to the combined effects of deregulation, devolution, and state preemption. For example, between 1980 and 2014, the difference between life expectancy at birth in Mississippi and New York more than tripled from 1.6 years to 5.5 years. Whereas New York allows local governments to raise the minimum wage, mandate paid sick leave, regulate firearms, and require calorie counts on restaurant menus, Mississippi preempts all four of these policies.<sup>11</sup>
- A <u>recent survey</u> found that over 70% of local health officials and 60% of mayors reported abandoning or delaying local policymaking efforts because of the threat of state preemption. Local policies chilled by the threat of preemption included efforts to regulate commercial tobacco, environmental hazards, firearms, minimum wage, safe housing, and transportation, among others.<sup>12</sup>
- Research has debunked the claim that state preemption is necessary to prevent a "patchwork" of local laws inside one state from harming residents, businesses, and consumers. To the contrary, analysis shows that people who use the patchwork argument to support preemption are generally arguing against *any* regulation at all, not against local variation.<sup>13</sup>
- In one study, infants born to mothers living near fracking sites were 25% more likely to have low birth weight, and their average birth weight also declined significantly. State preemption of local fracking bans may be linked to negative health outcomes for infants.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Montez, JK, Beckfield, J, Cooney, JK, Grumbach, JM, Hayward, MD, Koytak, HZ, WoolfH, S, Zajacova, A. US State Policies, Politics, and Life Expectancy. *The Milbank Quarterly*. 2020. doi:10.1111/1468-0009.12469.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Wolf D, Monnat S, Montez JK. *Profits protected, lives lost: The preemption tradeoff.* 2020 American Public Health Association Annual Meeting. October 2020. <a href="https://apha.confex.com/apha/2020/meetingapp.cgi/Paper/467648">https://apha.confex.com/apha/2020/meetingapp.cgi/Paper/467648</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Montez JK. Deregulation, Devolution, and State Preemption Laws' Impact on US Mortality Trends. *Am J Public Health*. 2017;107(11):1749-1750. doi: 10.2105/AJPH.2017.304080.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Rutkow L, McGinty MD, Wetter S, Vernick JS. Local Public Health Policymakers' Views on State Preemption: Results of a National Survey, 2018. *Am J Public Health*. 2019;109(8):1107-1110. doi:10.2105/AJPH.2019.305140.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Treskon M, Marotta J, Rajasekaran P, Ramakrishan K, Shroyer A, Greene S. *Do the Effects of a Regulatory Patchwork Justify State Preemption of Local Laws?* Urban Institute. January 2021. https://www.urban.org/research/publication/do-effects-regulatory-patchwork-justify-state-preemption-local-laws

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Currie, J, Greenstone, M, Meckel, K. Hydraulic fracturing and infant health: New evidence from Pennsylvania. *Science Advances*. 2017;3(12). DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.1603021. <a href="https://www.science.org/doi/10.1126/sciadv.1603021">https://www.science.org/doi/10.1126/sciadv.1603021</a>.

- A recent case study explored how some states have preempted local governments from restricting natural gas appliances, <sup>15</sup> the use of which has been linked to a number of negative health effects, including exposure to fine particulate matter, carcinogens, and other pollutants linked to respiratory illness. <sup>16,17</sup>
- Research suggests that taxes on sugar-sweetened beverages are associated with reductions in their purchase. <sup>18</sup> While research establishes that sugar-sweetened beverages increase the risk for cardiometabolic diseases and other maladies, <sup>19</sup> a number of states have nonetheless preempted local governments from levying taxes to discourage their consumption. <sup>20</sup>
- State laws preempting sanctuary policies can create hostile environments, deterring immigrants from seeking critical health care and social services, or even prohibit those services from being offered altogether. These laws may also have a chilling effect on accessing other health-related resources, including basic utilities (e.g., electricity and water), healthy foods, and public recreation spaces. Preemption of sanctuary policies that protect and support immigrants likely contribute to negative physical and mental health outcomes for those populations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Gibbs, M, Hsain, Z, Reagan, E, Wolfman, S, & Zaccarin, A-M. Overcoming state level preemption to electrify new buildings: A Philadelphia case study. *Journal of Science Policy & Governance*. 2022;21(01). doi:10.38126/jspg210104. https://doi.org/10.38126/JSPG210104.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Lewis, T. *The health risks of gas stoves explained*. Scientific American. January 19, 2023. https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/the-health-risks-of-gas-stoves-explained/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Seals, B, Krasner, A. *Health Effects from Gas Stove Pollution*. Rocky Mountain Institute; Physicians for Social Responsibility; Mothers Out Front; Sierra Club. 2020. <a href="https://rmi.org/insight/gas-stoves-pollution-health">https://rmi.org/insight/gas-stoves-pollution-health</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Petimar, J., Gibson, L. A., Yan, J., Bleich, S. N., Mitra, N., Trego, M. L., Lawman, H. G., & Roberto, C. A. (Accepted/In press). Sustained Impact of the Philadelphia Beverage Tax on Beverage Prices and Sales Over 2 Years. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*. 2022. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2021.12.012">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2021.12.012</a>. Colchero, M. A, Popkin, B, Rivera, J, Ng, S. W. Beverage purchases from stores in Mexico under the excise tax on sugar sweetened beverages: observational study. BMJ. 2016;352. doi: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.h6704">https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.h6704</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Malik, V, Hu, F. Sugar-Sweetened Beverages and Cardiometabolic Health: An Update of the Evidence. *Nutrients*. 2019;11(8). https://doi.org/10.3390/nu11081840.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Crosbie, E, Pomeranz, J, Wright, K, Hoeper, S, Schmidt, L. State Preemption: An Emerging Threat to Local Sugar-Sweetened Beverage Taxation. *Am J of Public Health*. January 2021;111. <a href="https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2020.306062">https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2020.306062</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Hall, M, Mann-Jackson, L, Rhodes, S. State Preemption of Local Immigration "Sanctuary" Policies: Legal Considerations. *Am J of Public Health*. 2021;111. https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2020.306018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Mann-Jackson L, Simán FM, Hall MA, Alonzo J, Linton JM, Rhodes SD. State Preemption of Municipal Laws and Policies that Protect Immigrant Communities: Impact on Latine Health and Well-Being in North Carolina. *INQUIRY: The Journal of Health Care Organization, Provision, and Financing*. 2022;59. doi:10.1177/00469580221087884. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177%2F00469580221087884">https://doi.org/10.1177%2F00469580221087884</a>.

## **Worker Protections and Economic Regulation**

<u>Research shows</u> that women, particularly women of color, and workers in low-wage jobs are disproportionately harmed by state preemption of local worker protection laws.<sup>23</sup>

#### **Minimum Wage**

<u>State preemption of minimum wage laws</u> prevents local governments from redressing health, social, and economic inequities. Increased minimum wages reduce wage inequality, disproportionately benefit women and individuals with lower education levels, and do not result in business closures or employment losses.<sup>24</sup>

- State preemption of local minimum wage laws prevent communities from <u>improving health outcomes</u> such as decreased adult body weight, increased infant birth weight, declined rates of preterm birth, declined child maltreatment reports,<sup>25</sup> and <u>lower rates</u> of suicide.<sup>26</sup>
- A study assessing how preemption affects birth outcomes a key indicator of population health found that state preemption of local minimum wage laws accounted for as much as 3.5% of infant deaths,<sup>27</sup> resulting in more than 600 infant deaths in 2018 alone.<sup>28</sup> The same study also found that the largest metro counties could reduce the infant mortality rate by 1.5 to 1.8% by increasing the minimum wage by one dollar.<sup>29</sup>
- A <u>report</u> examining minimum wage laws found that state preemption of previously enacted minimum wage laws in 12 cities and counties affected nearly 346,000 workers and resulted in nearly \$1.5 billion of

https://www.forworkingfamilies.org/resources/publications/challenging-state-interference-advance-gender-and-racial.

https://www.urban.org/research/publication/minimum-wages-what-does-research-tell-us-about-effectiveness-local-action.

https://www.urban.org/research/publication/minimum-wages-what-does-research-tell-us-about-effectiveness-local-action.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Partnership for Working Families. For all of Us, By All of Us: Challenging State Interference to Advance Gender and Racial Justice. May 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Marotta, J, Greene, S. *Minimum Wages: What Does the Research Tell Us about the Effectiveness of Local Action?*. Urban Institute. January 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Marotta, J, Greene, S. *Minimum Wages: What Does the Research Tell Us about the Effectiveness of Local Action?*. Urban Institute. January 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Kaufman JA, Salas-Hernández LK, Komro KA, Livingston, MD. Effects of increased minimum wages by unemployment rate on suicide in the USA. *J Epidemiol Community Health*. 2020;74:219-224.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Wolf D, Monnat S, Montez JK. *Profits protected, lives lost: The preemption tradeoff*. 2020 American Public Health Association Annual Meeting. October 2020. <a href="https://apha.confex.com/apha/2020/meetingapp.cgi/Paper/467648">https://apha.confex.com/apha/2020/meetingapp.cgi/Paper/467648</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Wolf, DA, Monnat, SM, Montez JK. Effects of US state preemption laws on infant mortality. *Preventive Medicine*. 2021;145. doi: 10.1016/j.ypmed.2021.106417. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0091743521000013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Wolf, DA, Monnat, SM, Montez JK. Effects of US state preemption laws on infant mortality. *Preventive Medicine*. 2021;145. doi: 10.1016/j.ypmed.2021.106417. <a href="https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0091743521000013">https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0091743521000013</a>.

lost income per year. These preemption laws disproportionately harmed women, people of color, and communities with high rates of poverty.<sup>30</sup>

#### **Paid Leave**

State preemption of paid-sick leave requirements may contribute to external causes of death.

• One study found statistically significant associations between paid-sick leave requirements and reductions in homicides (in men and women), suicides (in men), and alcohol poisoning (in women).<sup>31</sup> If state laws preempting paid-sick leave protections were repealed, mortality by these causes may decline by more than 5% in some places.<sup>32</sup>

Research finds that laws mandating universal paid leave reduce racial disparities, increase economic security, and improve health outcomes, including reduced emergency department use, increased use of preventive care, and fewer occupational injuries. The <u>same research</u> did not find evidence that paid leave laws reduce employment, wages, or labor force participation.<sup>33</sup>

- A large portion of <u>those without paid sick leave</u> are low-wage, part-time workers who are disproportionately Latinx, Black Americans, and women, meaning state preemption that prevents cities and counties from adopting paid leave laws adds to racial and socioeconomic inequities.<sup>34</sup>
- When a worker without paid leave must miss work because of their own illness or caregiving
  responsibilities, two days of <u>lost wages</u> equate to a month's worth of gas, three days equal a monthly
  utility payment, and roughly a week of lost wages equals an entire month's rent or mortgage payment.<sup>35</sup>
  State preemption of local paid leave laws prevents local governments from addressing these economic
  injustices.

## **Equitable Housing Policies**

Despite a serious and worsening housing crisis and an unprecedented <u>public health emergency</u>, widespread <u>state</u> <u>preemption of equitable housing policies</u> has prevented local governments from ensuring access to safe, stable, and affordable housing. <u>Evidence shows</u> that housing instability is associated with poor health outcomes,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Laura Huizar and Yannet Lathrop. *Fighting Wage Preemption: How Workers Have Lost Billions in Wages and How We Can Restore Local Democracy*. National Employment Law Project. July 2019. https://s27147.pcdn.co/wp-content/uploads/Fighting-Wage-Preemption-Report-7-19.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Wolf DA, Montez JK, Monnat SM. U.S. state preemption laws and working-age mortality. *Am J Prev Med*. 2022;63(5): 681-688. doi:10.1016/j.amepre.2022.06.005. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2022.06.005.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Wolf DA, Montez JK, Monnat SM. U.S. state preemption laws and working-age mortality. *Am J Prev Med*. 2022;63(5): 681-688. doi:10.1016/j.amepre.2022.06.005. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2022.06.005">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2022.06.005</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Marotta, J, Greene, S. *Paid Sick Days: What Does the Research Tell Us about the Effectiveness of Local Action?*. Urban Institute. January 2019.

https://www.urban.org/research/publication/paid-sick-days-what-does-research-tell-us-about-effectiveness-local-action.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Partnership for Working Families. For all of Us, By All of Us: Challenging State Interference to Advance Gender and Racial Justice. May 2019.

https://www.forworkingfamilies.org/resources/publications/challenging-state-interference-advance-gender-and-racial.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Gould E, Schieder, J. Work sick or lose pay? The high cost of being sick when you don't get paid sick days. Economic Policy Institute. June 2017.

https://www.epi.org/publication/work-sick-or-lose-pay-the-high-cost-of-being-sick-when-vou-dont-get-paid-sick-days.

particularly for children and adolescents, and that the lack of access to safe, stable, and affordable housing leads to stress, poor mental health, and reduced access to key health-promoting opportunities. Housing safety and stability is particularly important in light of the COVID-19 pandemic and widespread stay-at-home orders.

- A <u>study suggests</u> a relationship between state preemption of local mandatory inclusionary zoning (IZ) policies and both increased rates of self-reported poor or fair health status and a greater likelihood that Black adults report delaying medical care because of cost.<sup>36</sup>
- Austin, Texas, sought to address racial and socioeconomic discrimination in rental housing by prohibiting landlords from rejecting otherwise qualified tenants based solely on their source of income (e.g., federal housing assistance).<sup>37</sup> Across the country, only one in three voucher households is protected by nondiscrimination laws like those Austin adopted. The Texas state legislature responded by invalidating Austin's ordinance and preempting localities from adopting similar antidiscrimination laws,<sup>38</sup> despite the absence of any statewide protections for recipients of housing assistance and despite clear evidence that source-of-income discrimination disproportionately harms people of color.<sup>39</sup>

## **Preemption in the South**

<u>Longstanding state preemption</u> of local governments in the South is a continuation of "state-sanctioned policies and practices rooted in racism and designed to uphold white supremacy" by suppressing the political power of communities of color.<sup>40</sup>

Research shows that the abuse of state preemption is particularly prevalent in the South, where
overwhelmingly white, male, and conservative state legislatures have blocked the ability of local
communities – often Black and Brown communities – from responding to the needs and values of their
residents. These communities have been prevented from enacting policies on a multitude of work-related
issues, such as minimum wages, fair scheduling laws, paid leave programs, local hire laws, prevailing wage
laws, and other workplace protections.<sup>41</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Melton-Fant, C. Relationship Between State Preemption of Inclusionary Zoning Policies and Health Outcomes: Is There Disparate Impact Among People of Color?. *Housing Policy Debate*. 2020. doi: 10.1080/10511482.2020.1798488.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Austin, Tex., Ordinance 20141211-050 (Dec. 11, 2014).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> 2015 Tex. Gen. Laws Ch. 1140 (S.B. 267).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Tighe JR, Hatch ME, Mead J. Source of income discrimination and fair housing policy. *J Plan Lit.* 2016;32(1):3-15. https://doi.org/10.1177/0885412216670603.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Blair H, Cooper D, Wolfe J, Worker J. *Preempting progress: State interference in local policymaking prevents people of color, women, and low-income workers from making ends meet in the South*. Economic Policy Institute. September 2020. https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Blair H, Cooper D, Wolfe J, Worker J. *Preempting progress: State interference in local policymaking prevents people of color, women, and low-income workers from making ends meet in the South*. Economic Policy Institute. September 2020. <a href="https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south">https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south</a>.

- o When the Alabama state legislature preempted a minimum wage increase in Birmingham, Alabama, they denied pay raises to an estimated 65,000 low-wage workers, disproportionately harming Black people and women.<sup>42</sup>
- When Texas preempted local paid sick leave laws, they excluded millions of workers –
   overwhelmingly people of color from the opportunities and health benefits that those laws would provide.<sup>43</sup>
- The <u>misuse of state preemption</u> has also undermined the ability for <u>local governments in the South</u> to respond to the health, social, and economic crises resulting from COVID-19, which has disproportionately harmed many communities of color.<sup>44,45</sup>

## **Preemption in the Midwest**

The abuse of preemption that has suppressed communities of color in the Midwest has its roots in the segregation policies implemented in response to the Great Migration.<sup>46</sup>

Research shows that the abuse of state preemption in the Midwest is widespread, second only to the South.<sup>47</sup> State lawmakers in the Midwest, who are majority white and male, have used preemption to deny local governments the ability to improve job quality and housing stability through minimum wage increases, fair scheduling laws, and paid leave requirements. These preemptive laws disproportionately affect people of color, women, immigrants, and workers who are paid low wages.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Blair H, Cooper D, Wolfe J, Worker J. *Preempting progress: State interference in local policymaking prevents people of color, women, and low-income workers from making ends meet in the South*. Economic Policy Institute. September 2020. <a href="https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south">https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Blair H, Cooper D, Wolfe J, Worker J. *Preempting progress: State interference in local policymaking prevents people of color, women, and low-income workers from making ends meet in the South*. Economic Policy Institute. September 2020. <a href="https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south">https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Blair H, Cooper D, Wolfe J, Worker J. *Preempting progress: State interference in local policymaking prevents people of color, women, and low-income workers from making ends meet in the South*. Economic Policy Institute. September 2020. https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-south.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Haddow, K, Carr, D, Winig, BD, Adler, S. *Preemption, Public Health, and Equity in the Time of COVID-19*. August 2020. https://www.publichealthlawwatch.org/covid19-policy-playbook.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Wolfe, J, Hickey, S, Kamper, D, Cooper, D. *Preempting progress in the heartland: State lawmakers in the Midwest prevent shared prosperity and racial, gender, and immigrant justice by interfering in local policymaking*. Economic Policy Institute. October 2021. https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-midwest/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Wolfe, J, Hickey, S, Kamper, D, Cooper, D. *Preempting progress in the heartland: State lawmakers in the Midwest prevent shared prosperity and racial, gender, and immigrant justice by interfering in local policymaking*. Economic Policy Institute. October 2021. <a href="https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-midwest/">https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-midwest/</a>.

- When the Missouri and Iowa state legislatures preempted minimum wage increases in Kansas City, St. Louis, and various Iowa counties, they denied pay raises to hundreds of thousands of workers, a greater proportion of which are women or workers of color.<sup>48</sup>
- When the Michigan state legislature passed House Bill 4052 (2015), nicknamed the "Death Star Bill," it preempted local governments from implementing a range of policies that would benefit workers, including minimum wages, fair scheduling regulations, paid leave mandates, and prevailing wage laws. Fair scheduling laws would have benefited 38,702 retail and food service workers in Detroit, 77% of which are Black.<sup>49</sup>

# **Local Fiscal Authority**

Preemption of <u>local authority to raise and spend money</u> often results in the loss or diversion of municipal revenues, harming urban, suburban, and rural communities alike.<sup>50</sup>

- During the time of COVID-19, <u>restrictions on municipal revenues</u> forced cities and counties to cut services, lay off and furlough employees, and mothball capital projects, which had consequences for local employment, business contracts, and overall investment in the economy and community.<sup>51</sup>
- State laws that <u>limit local fiscal authority</u> to raise and spend revenue—known as tax and expenditure limits (TELs)—force local governments to turn to alternative forms of revenue generation, which often means fines and fees. <sup>52</sup> <u>Research shows</u> that people of color and residents who have low income are disproportionately affected by fines and fees, which can "affect credit scores, plunge families into debt, result in loss of a driver's license, or lead to incarceration"—all outcomes that negatively affect health. <sup>53</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Wolfe, J, Hickey, S, Kamper, D, Cooper, D. *Preempting progress in the heartland: State lawmakers in the Midwest prevent shared prosperity and racial, gender, and immigrant justice by interfering in local policymaking*. Economic Policy Institute. October 2021. https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-midwest/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Wolfe, J, Hickey, S, Kamper, D, Cooper, D. *Preempting progress in the heartland: State lawmakers in the Midwest prevent shared prosperity and racial, gender, and immigrant justice by interfering in local policymaking*. Economic Policy Institute. October 2021. <a href="https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-midwest/">https://www.epi.org/publication/preemption-in-the-midwest/</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Bravo, N, Warner, ME, Aldag, A. *Grabbing market share, Taming rogue cities and Crippling Counties: Views from the field on state preemption of local authority*. Dept. of City and Regional Planning, Cornell University. March 2020. http://cms.mildredwarner.org/p/298.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Haddow, K, Carr, D, Winig, BD, Adler, S. *Preemption, Public Health, and Equity in the Time of COVID-19*. August 2020. https://www.publichealthlawwatch.org/covid19-policy-playbook.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Haddow, K, Carr, D, Winig, BD, Adler, S. *Preemption, Public Health, and Equity in the Time of COVID-19*. August 2020. https://www.publichealthlawwatch.org/covid19-policy-playbook.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Watts, MH, Michel, KH. Equitable Enforcement to Achieve Health Equity: An Introductory Guide for Policymakers and Practitioners. ChangeLab Solutions. July 2020. https://www.changelabsolutions.org/product/equitable-enforcement-achieve-health-equity.

# **About the Authors**

The Local Solutions Support Center (LSSC) is a national hub that coordinates and creates efforts to counter the abuse of preemption. Its goals are to raise awareness of state preemption and its consequences, reduce the use of this threat to local autonomy, and strengthen the power of local governments to advance policies that promote equity, inclusion, public health, and civic participation.

ChangeLab Solutions is a nonprofit organization that provides legal information on matters relating to public health. The legal information in this document does not constitute legal advice or legal representation. For legal advice, readers should consult a lawyer in their state.